Systematic review and network meta-analysis of intravenous ibuprofen vs. intravenous indomethacin vs. placebo in the management of clinically and/or echocardiographically important patent ductus arteriosus in preterm infants at greater than 24 hours of life.

Lisa Jane Jones

BNurs, Grad Cert Paed Crit Care, Grad Dip Clin Epid

Submitted for Master of Philosophy Community Medicine and Clinical Epidemiology Thesis Examination

December, 2011

Statement of Originality

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Statement of collaboration

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis has been done in collaboration with other researchers. I have included as part of the thesis a statement clearly outlining the extent of collaboration, with whom and under what auspices.

Statement of Authorship

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis contains a published paper of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of the thesis a written statement, endorsed by my supervisor, attesting to my contribution to the joint publication.

Other acknowledgements

I wish to thank the following people for their support and contributions to this thesis:

Dr Paul Craven, my principal supervisor, who provided me with direction and advice on Neonatal pathophysiology and Dr John Attia, my secondary supervisor, who provided me with assistance on epidemiological considerations.

Dr Ammarin Thakkinstian, who produced the initial network analysis and methods for the published paper and provided the methodology for subsequent meta-analyses.

Dr lan Wright, who assisted with study selection for the systematic review and editing of the published paper prior to journal submission.

Dr's Javeed Travadi and Koert De Waal for their interest and encouragement.

Dr Kerry Inder, for her much valued ongoing support and assistance as research Higher Degree Coordinator.

Dedication

To my husband Stephen and son Matthew for their support and endless patience during the writing of this thesis.

To my nursing colleagues in the Neonatal Intensive Care Unit at John Hunter Children's Hospital.

Table of contents

Abstract

Introduction

Chapter 1: Literature Review

Section 1 – The ductus arteriosus

Section 2 - Patent ductus arteriosus (PDA)

Section 3 - Pathophysiology attributed to PDA

Section 4 – PDA Management

Section 5 – Indirect Comparisons

Conclusion

Research Proposal

Chapter 2: Published version of research paper

Appendices: STATA output and supplementary tables

Chapter 3: Discussion

Section 1 – New research directions.

Section 2 – Recommendations for future research.

Conclusion

References

Abstract

Objectives

To evaluate the effects of indomethacin or ibuprofen compared with placebo on closure, morbidity and mortality in preterm infants <37 weeks' gestation with echocardiographically and/or clinically important patent ductus arteriosus (PDA) at >24 h of life.

Data sources

MEDLINE, EMBASE, Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials, CINAHL, Cochrane Library, clinicaltrials.gov, controlled-trials.com, American Pediatric and European Paediatric Research Societies and Effective Care of the Newborn Infant.

Review methods

Systematic review with network meta-analysis of randomised studies comparing intravenous indomethacin, ibuprofen or placebo for PDA in preterm infants at >24 h of life.

Results

Ten trials compared intravenous indomethacin versus intravenous ibuprofen, nine compared intravenous indomethacin versus placebo and one intravenous ibuprofen versus placebo. Both intravenous indomethacin [pooled RR 2.39 (95% CI 2.05 to 2.78)] and intravenous ibuprofen [RR 2.40 (95% CI 2.03 to 2.84)] closed a PDA more effectively than placebo. Intravenous ibuprofen was associated with approximately 30% greater risk of chronic lung disease than intravenous indomethacin [RR 1.28 (95% CI 1.03 to 1.60)] or placebo [RR 1.29 (95% CI 0.99 to 1.70)]. Differences in risk or benefit were not significant between any combination of intravenous indomethacin, intravenous ibuprofen or placebo groups for intraventricular haemorrhage, necrotising enterocolitis and death. Reporting on neurological outcomes was insufficient for pooling. Sensitivity analyses indicate a gestational and postnatal age dependent effect on PDA closure and the risk of CLD. The majority of trials comparing intravenous indomethacin with placebo administered non-randomised rescue treatment to > 20% of the placebo group. Sample size estimations for intravenous indomethacin suggest large numbers are needed to provide adequate power to detect a difference in the risk of outcomes other than PDA closure. Smaller numbers are required for intravenous ibuprofen with a minimum of 131 per group for the outcome of CLD.

Conclusions

Intravenous indomethacin or ibuprofen administered to preterm infants for PDA at >24 h of life promoted ductal closure, but other short-term benefits were not seen. Data from randomized trials concerning the effect of treatment with indomethacin or ibuprofen for PDA closure on IVH, CLD, NEC, survival and longer-term neurodevelopmental outcomes is presently insufficient to guide current practice. There is a need for well-designed good quality modern randomized controlled trials comparing intravenous ibuprofen and intravenous indomethacin administered for echo-targeted PDA and PDA detected by clinical signs in preterm infants at greater than 24 hours of life. Such trials should be multi-centre and incorporate improved methods of handling the administration of rescue treatment in the placebo group in order to improve the chance of detecting a benefit or risk. Data on longerterm respiratory and neurological outcomes are also urgently needed. Suggested trial methods include comparing early targeted at <24 hours with placebo randomised to either echo-targeted or symptomatic PDA as rescue at > 24 hours of life. Comparisons can then be made between the risk of outcomes in preterm infants with PDA receiving rescue treatment based on echo alone compared to those randomised to symptomatic rescue treatment but remaining untreated.